SUBLIMATING SUBLIME OF AVANT-GARDE BETWEEN VITALISM AND DETERMINISM: A MULTI-CONCEPTUAL VIEW

Ramesh Kandagiri

Assistant Professor, Department of Painting, College of Art, Govt. of N.C.T. of Delhi, New Delhi

Abstract

In today's capitalism Mediocrity Mass constantly actualizes the sublimation of sublime of avant-garde Exceptional Individuals mediating their Essential Individuation to the Consumers-Mass of boundlessly evolving technological and information society. The parametric determinism encouraging Consumer-Mass in appreciating work of art is mysterious phenomenon of sublimation which is though democratic yet challenging for up-gradation of 'sublime' through mysterious ontological autopoiesis in the avant-garde Exceptional Individuals' 'vitalism'. Despite the fact that Mediocrity-Mass reproduce exact copy of 'original' as tactfully engineered Essential Derivatives their mediation in Essential Individuation can't be underestimated. Although the centripetal dynamic equilibrium of 'vitalism' of the Exceptional Individuals keep their pre-individuals constantly restoring 'sublime' through its élan vital yet also updates its peripheral dynamic disequilibrium as processual 'vitalism' to interact with the dynamic disequilibrium of the materialistic 'determinism?' It is proposed that in the utter failure in reinventing themselves from vintage avant-garde to post-avantgarde the Exceptional Individuals are reincarnated as Enigmatic Individuals. The paper, while investigating on 'conditions of newness in art, raises a debate that contemplative process of intensive autopoiesis in the 'vitalism' of pre-individual sublimating 'sublime' has dual affect, its actualization through the dynamic disequilibrium of deterministic conditions as great extensive sympoietic processors and, upgrading the quality of 'sublime' that transcends itself. The paper also argues that the alleged 'alienation' caused to the

avant-garde creative individual in the process of sublimation of 'sublime' actualized to the Consumer Mass, is not a curse to élan vital but bliss for the quality of its 'sublime' symbolically manifested in the newer aesthetic alchemy.

"You are quaffing drink from a hundred fountains: whenever any of these hundred yields less, your pleasure is diminished. But when the sublime fountain gushes from within you, no longer need steal from the other fountain"

-Rumi

"Great indeed is the sublimity of the Creative, to which all beings owe their beginnings and which permeates all heaven"

-Lao Tzu

"Sublimation is not a voluntary and the forcible channeling of instinct into a spurious field of application (...) Sublimatio is a great mystery. Freud has appropriated this concept and usurped it for the sphere of the will, and the bourgeois, rationalistic ethos"

-Carl Gustav Jung.

Kevword: Sublime. Sublimation. Vitalism. Sympoiesis, Determinism, Autopoiesis, Preindividual, Individual, Individuality, Individuation, Individuation. Essential Essential Derivatives. Consumer-Mass, Mediocrity-Mass, Mediocrity-Individual. Exceptional Individual, Enigmatic Individual

1.INTRODUCTION

It is the pre-individuals within the individuals who while individuation make an amalgamated society. Individuals, though depend on society try to express their never-ending process of individuation that emerges from their pre-individual field (Nicolini, 2019). Creative individuals have more responsibility towards the society and therefore they sublimate their 'sublime' experience by actualizing it through individuation to the society in order to validate their state of being creative individual. Creative-intellectual movements led by avant-garde are open-ended. These were directed and motivated by exceptionally contemplative individuals awakened by their constant response to the perpetual change caused by the continuous encounters between the dynamic disequilibrium of 'vitalism' (Autopoiesis) and dynamic disequilibrium of 'determinism' (Sympoiesis). They may be called Exceptional Individuals. It is the dynamic quality of their 'sublime' and its sublimation through individuation of the creative individuals that makes them Exceptional Individuals in the creative and cultural industry, and thus their individuality is validated otherwise which would continue as pseudo-individuality. According to Adorno and Horkheimer, "individual is an illusion, but individuality is what keeps society from collapsing." (Barrett, 2003) A creative individual affects the materialization of the shared consciousness through synergic alchemy of personal and collective unconscious of the society. This determines the individuality of the individual. 'Sublime' seems to be a utopian notion of elevated quality of greatness as experienced by our emotion when it overwhelms our rationality, "to begin with 'the sublime,' like 'the numinous,' is in Kantian language an idea or concept, 'that cannot be unfolded' or explicated (unauswickelbar)." (Otto, 1917) Kant himself posited, "beautiful is limited, the sublime is limitless, so that the mind in the presence of the sublime, attempting to imagine what it cannot, has pain in the failure but pleasure in contemplating the immensity of the attempt." (Kant, 1781) Kant indicate at the limitation of mind rather than the impossibility of attaining the 'sublime;' it raises argument that isn't the failure of attaining or revalidating 'sublime' has perennially inspired the Exceptional Individuals to reincarnate as Enigmatic Individuals in order to keep avant-garde updated? And also, that 'shocking' aesthetics of avant-garde has 'sublime' as perennial driver. It can be said that a work of art has sublime quality because it can be a tabulation of 'rational signs' that "threaten to overpass the bounds of our understanding by some 'dynamic' or 'mathematic' areatness, by manifestation of force or magnitude in spatial extent." (Otto, 1917) But it is the sublimation encountered by emotion and rationality that renews the validity of 'sublime'. In that view the base complacency in relation with the 'sublime' is understood as phenomenal manifestation of the noumenon so long as the sublimation is in action. Because 'sublime' through autopoiesis of 'vitalism' is either Buddhahood in the earlier times or dissemblance in today's time because spurious Buddhahood being a debatable issue in general life of our times is always reality-checked exposed by sympoiesis of 'determinism.' This is the reason fearing its own probable customization in our times Buddhahood was sufficiently wise in decentralizing and spreading itself to reach each and every pre-individual and went undercover into their consciousness. If the former state of existence is an authentic personification as socio-spiritual avant-garde, Siddharth Gautama, The Buddha, in the specific time of the history then the latter is essentially obvious in our times and questionable if it deceives through the shadow of the former. But all that is not to reject the idea that Siddharth Gautama. The Buddha, was an avant-garde Enigmatic Individual of his time as empirical-transcendental social scientist.

2. ESSENTIAL INDIVIDUATION, MEDIOCRITY-MASS, ESSENTIAL DERIVATIVES, CONSUMER-MASS, MEDIOCRITY INDIVIDUALS, ENIGMATIC INDIVIDUALS

Although being 'outsiders,' Exceptional Individuals never enjoy the intellectual and aesthetic appreciation from the mass culture but a compensation is granted to them with an assured mediation between the individuation as sublimation of their 'sublime' and mass culture of capitalist society. This hereafter may be called Essential Individuation (in Nicolini's words living individuation). The mass culture of capitalist society, hereafter may be called Consumer-Mass. The *mediation* performed by the cult of 'skilled mediocre', hereafter may be called Mediocrity Mass, while the so 'drawn derivatives,' may be called Essential Derivatives. Thus, Essential Derivatives are media for the consumption and actualization of 'sublime' to the Consumer-Mass. Mediocrity-Mass perform to assist Essential Individuation of the 'original' artworks of Exceptional Individuals who create 'sublime' through avant-garde. 'Sublime' is a personal attribute of the *avant-garde* in the form of Exceptional Individual but then its sublimation is actualized by sympolesis through

Essential Individuation. The experience of 'sublime' may be possible through ontological autopoiesis but not without contemplating between two or more discrete realities until Essential Individuals who created *avantgarde* are reincarnated as Enigmatic Individuals. The Enigmatic Individuals are the higher version of Exceptional Individuals, they are self-deprecating and can ontologically contemplate and venture into transcognitive dimensions of dynamic equilibrium of 'vitalism,' and also between dynamic disequilibrium of 'vitalism' and dynamic disequilibrium of 'determinism' simultaneously. Mediocrity Individuals are highly skilled and viciously opportunist doppelgangers (the second half) of the split personality of vintage Exceptional Individuals (the first half).

3. INTERRELATIONSHIP BETWEEN 'AVANT-GARDE' AND 'MODERNISM'

Modernism though rampantly celebrates the modern society but ignores to reconcile art back to the whatsoever advancement of life, while *avant-garde* accomplishes this task reacting to modernism's this incompatibility by creating new art with shocking ideas to express and reinforce dramatic political and social changes. (Barrett, 2003)

But historical Avant-garde is mysteriously connected with the spree of modernism. Modernism as a creative movement subsumes avant-garde due to its short-lived 'shock'. The nature has it that opportunist modernism inevitably betrays avant-garde in spite of being fed on it. Essential Individuals like Paul Cezanne, the 'Father of Modern Art,' was an avant-garde but numerous branches of European Modernism despite being fed on him went rampant on their advancement hardly acknowledging back their progenitor. However, Cezanne had both the piety of vivacious child honoring his fore-bearers and magnanimity of esoteric saint to let go the derision and ignorance he endured from his progeny. He was presided by the historical Avant-garde as a movement in art that started in 1850 with the propounding on 'Realism' by Courbet along with others under the influence of Scientific Socialism. 'Newer' concepts of everyday subject-matter with 'temporal light' radically replaced spiritual connotation of 'eternal light' of religious and historical subjects of their immediate predecessors, Romantic and Neoclassical schools; special importance was given to natural figureground and non-idealized depiction of peasants.

This was foregrounding principle for all the subsequent movements of Modernism to come. Similarly, avantgardism of Impressionism that contemplated on changing moods of 'sunlight,' Post-Impressionism that focused on 'individualism' to manifest 'inner reality' and Cubism pushed for drastic revolution in accepting the two-dimensional pictorial space as reality while breaking away from the figure-ground pictorial space hitherto established by Realists. These shifting paradigms indebted to the austere, rigorous and vigorous recherché of Paul Cezanne, who failing to sublimate his 'sublime' with an identity of traditional Exceptional Individual reincarnated in himself as Enigmatic Individual and inaugurated a 'newer' way of seeing in plastic art. He with a far-reaching influence, opened multiple possibilities in plastic art which are inexhaustible till today and even likely to be so till the farthest future. Who knew that Paul Cezanne's contemplative autopoiesis for inventing the hitherto undiscovered 'objectivity' in the plastic art would invert the entire course of artistic perception only through his self-criticism and 'self-doubt?' (Read, 1968) And since Cezanne's autopoiesis led awakenings transcendentallyempirically justified through newer mediality and mediation it is argued that his autopoiesis to 'sublime' was sublimated through sympoiesis into several branches and concepts of modernism shooting off as respective avant-gardes. Also, it is argued that as an alltime avant-garde Enigmatic Individual Cezanne's fatherly-benevolent 'vitalism' that created 'sublime' had transcended itself, as he defied his own mannerism inventing 'abstraction' to which he himself transcended. It is hard to refrain placing Pt. Kumar Gandharva as complementary compatibility to that of Cezanne, that as avant-garde Enigmatic Individual Pt. Gandharva too had in his oeuvre-account iconoclast refusal to be bound to any gharana (style) of Hindustani Classical singing. Having his one lung removed due to Tuberculosis Pt. Gandharva was forced to invent his innovative style of 'short phrase' giving a pause of his vocal sound, ahat naad (struck sound) to let the anahat naad (unstruck perennial sound) to enter. Pt. Gandharva's this recherché while infusing 'abstraction' in classical singing without disrupting the perennial awareness radically altered the tradition of Hindustani Classical forever. It was the autopoiesis of alienation within Pt. Gandharva's

'vitalism' caused by deterministic refrainment from singing (ruled out by doctors) due to his one lung removal that for years his *arohi-avarohi* (intonations) of *alap* (unmetered raga) was processed via sympoiesis during his mute listening to birds singing, rumbling of wind and roadside *ektara* (one-stringed musical instrument) singer bestowing him drastic revelation. The 'alienation' came as bliss for the sublimation of Pt. Gandharva's 'sublime' further venerating his *élan vital* through autopoiesis-sympoiesis doublet had actualized to the qualified audience whose 'sublime' too were venerated listening to his unique style of singing.

But despite the recurrence of autopoiesis led contemplative awakenings of 'vitalism' by the brigade of Exceptional Individuals who introduced newer visions periodically to invigorate the various shoots of new *avant-gardism* within the ongoing movement of Modernism, the historical *avant-garde* faded away gradually, because "the concept of avant-garde was closely linked to the notion of secession and succession."(Willette, 2012) This proves the truth of perennial intermittence of birth and death of historical *avant-garde*.

4. 'CENTRIPETAL VITALISM' AND 'CENTRIFUGAL VITALISM' AS 'BEING' AND 'BECOMING'

When an Exceptional Individuals pioneer a new movement in Art, the Mediocrity-Mass attaches itself to it and drives the momentum of the movement as long as it is possible. To that extent, Mediocrity-Mass is significant for the new movement. There seems to be a dynamic process inherent to a new avant-garde movement wherein Exceptional Individuals collectively giving birth to the *idea* of 'sublime' in the form of art works to be sublimated to the Consumer-Mass no matter through the stereotypical mimics produced by the Mediocrity Mass. But, as a result, they drain out the movement to the point of an end of the road to the movement by applying extra force in mass production of works with the flick of newness till it completely exhausts. Then begins the rigor mortis of the movement of avant-garde dying temporarily and waiting for the next *avant-garde* movement for echoing 'shocking' impulses through it. Therefore, between the death of a former and the birth of the later movements, the soul of the creative consciousness, the élan vital (Bergson, 1907) of the Exceptional Individuals convulses in dynamic equilibrium in its periphery to be reborn. Deleuze's 'vitalism' (Loland, 2020) and sympoiesis (Remme, 2020) within the *avant-garde* awaits in dynamic equilibrium to be reborn but the flux of creative desire as representative of *élan vital* causing *disequilibrium* (Colebrook, 2002) seeks sites of material *indeterminations* to be manifested as 'invention' of new form and new practice constantly propelling itself to evolve and to become other (Grosz, 2007). This causes rolling on of genuine movements one after another.

In our times of trans-postmodernism, the momentum of a creative movement is required to be higher and richer than the creative requirement appropriated to the Consumers-Mass. A creative consciousness being swaved away by blindfolded materialism of Consumers-Mass would not be sublimating 'sublime' of art but degenerate it because then the *alienation* caused will be fatal to the *élan vital*. Therefore, there must be an agent who will rejuvenate the *élan vital* by transforming the soul of the Exceptional Individual as a compensation to the perennial loss of 'aura' of his oeuvre. And that transforming agent is sublimation of 'sublime' bringing in revelation of 'shock' as bonus through what Dabrowski calls Theory of Positive Degeneration. The 'shocking' contemplative revelations of 'sublime' in their 'liminal space' sustained the potential to 'shock' people perennially. 'Sublime' cannot sustain on rot as it transcends even itself and perennially rises from its own ashes.

Although of multidisciplinary concern the term 'vitalism' could be classified into two parts, 'being' and 'becoming'. There is this catalytic role of the *élan vital* for the 'being' part of the core of 'vitalism' generating dynamic equilibrium, we may call as 'Centripetal Vitalism' of the 'pre-individual' keeping him from falling off to 'determinism.' Then there is 'becoming' part of 'vitalism' in its periphery wherein *élan vital* is in constant action generating dynamic disequilibrium, its processual disposition equipping the pre-individual confronting and interacting with the peripheral dvnamic disequilibrium of the 'determinism' and with other 'mere beings' to transform as individual, we may call it as 'Centrifugal Vitalism'. This peripheral dynamic disequilibrium of the 'determinism' generates the extensive reality which are otherwise in 'non-living' stasis without this interaction. Both 'Centripetal Vitalism' and 'Centrifugal Vitalism' collectively move with dynamic disequilibrium of intensive reality constantly

encountering and interacting with the peripheral dynamic disequilibrium of the 'determinism' of the extensive reality owe to what Deleuze calls "lived experience". Here, in the 'lived experience' 'abstraction' takes place where 'abstract' is not opposed to 'concrete' collectively generate dynamic disequilibrium of intensive reality with "tendency towards change.' Then there is the 'discrete', the dynamic disequilibrium of 'determinism' as extensive reality, to which 'concrete' is opposed to because of "its tendency towards stasis." (Adkins, 2020) This encountered interaction between intensive reality of dynamic disequilibrium of 'Centripetal-Centrifugal Vitalism' and extensive reality of dynamic disequilibrium of 'parametric determinism' is again mediated by catalytic 'Centripetal Vitalism' in the form of 'processual 'vitalism.' (Osborne, 2020) Though, the 'parametric determinism' consists of dynamic complexity causing the effervescent-intermittent dynamic disequilibrium at its periphery but they themselves are static at their core and constantly need catalytic rejuvenation of 'Centripetal Vitalism' in the form of 'processual 'vitalism.' Thus, in the process of transformation into 'individual' as 'becoming', the 'being' part of his 'vitalism,' 'Centripetal Vitalism' keeps his intensive reality of dynamic disequilibrium of 'Centripetal-Centrifugal Vitalism' from either dissolving or freezing into the static core of peripheral dynamic disequilibrium of 'parametric determinism', the extensive reality of non-organism. However rather it reverts back to perennial 'lived experience' of the avantgarde Exceptional Individual negotiating through autopoietic contemplation on the dichotomy between 'indeterminism' of 'free will' of the intensive reality and 'determinism' of causative extensive reality.

5. THE MIDDLE-PATH OF AVANT-GARDE EXCEPTIONAL INDIVIDUALS

This is the reason an *avant-garde* Exceptional Individuals are supposed to be taking the middle path between the positions of *'hard determinism'*, *'hard indeterminism' (pessimistic incompatibilism), 'soft libertarianism'*. And also, *avant-garde* Exceptional Individuals should be warned especially of the *'hard incompatibilism'* and *'hard indeterminism'* which respectively deny that both 'determinism' and 'indeterminism' are incompatible and, that both the notions that external reality is deterministic and that anything like 'free will' exists. Moreover, *avant-garde* Exceptional Individuals shouldn't agree with the 'compatibilists' either, who reject the dichotomy between determinism and 'free will.'

The *avant-garde* Exceptional Individuals discharge their creativity with exceptional ease effortlessly in a contemplative mode as the alchemist of philosophical, empirical and metaphorical ways of knowing with perennially envisioned newness; the reason why *avant-garde* Exceptional Individuals always 'shock' the world. The very innate trait in the *avant-garde* Exceptional Individuals in perpetually making balance between their own intensive reality (autopoiesis) and extensive reality (sympoiesis) leaves them to be self-critical.

6. AVANT-GARDE 'SHOCK' PROPOSED BY 'LIMINAL SPACE' IN THE ELAN VITAL OF EXCEPTIONAL INDIVIDUALS AS THE SCRUTINIZED RESULT OF SELF-CRITICISM

Attaining the stasis of mind might be the eastern concept of meditation for achieving alienating veneration for stasis of dynamic equilibrium within the 'being.' But in general life it is the 'imagined stasis' within the disequilibrium of the 'determinism' that causes the 'virtual' to 'actualize' as 'real' (Deleuze, 1994); in turn this constant 'indeterminism' of 'Centripetal vitalism' and dynamic disequilibrium of 'materialistic determinism' undergoes the *repetition* of *intensities* within modernism to be elevated with 'sublime' by the avant-garde as 'vital' *difference* (lbid.) to be sublimated to the Consumer-Mass. The 'sublime' is envisioned in the 'liminal space' of the pre-individual's ontological self within the individuation of Exceptional Individual as claimed to be discharging its action as 'ontic referent' within him when he is a full-fledged avant-garde. Deleuze confirms the significance of individuation and calls 'vitalism' as an "ontological framework of transcendental empiricism as actual philosophy of life." He drew his support from Nietzsche's 'notion of being as becoming.' (Deleuze & Guattari: 1987) It is the transcendental self-awareness within the ontological self of Exceptional Individual whose autopoiesis in society is processed via its dialogical counterpart sympoiesis as his epistemological self-validates the status of his being 'ontic referent' for liberation of knowledge via 'liminal space' in the 'lived experience.' This exercise has double action, first, that the activated

'liminal space' reality-checks the 'pre-individual' falling prey to 'subliminal stimuli' and, second, that it constantly wards off the solipsism syndrome; Hubert Herman connotes it as 'Dialogical Self Theory'. It is in this 'liminal space' where the 'sublime' is experienced neither below nor above the threshold of consciousness of 'preindividual' within the avant-garde Exceptional Individual and that it is a state of mind which is free of intentionality of the mind. Hence it is the phenomenon of consciousness 'rising above the mind' and seceding whatsoever concept or preconception mind is holding. Therefore, the state of experiencing 'sublime' activates the state of self-criticism within the avant-garde Exceptional Individual to criticize its own whatsoever mental blocks and thereby receive the 'shocking idea', eventually an iconoclast one. In this case the mind of the Exceptional Individual as avant-garde is initially 'shocked' before 'shocking' the audience. Therefore, the process of envisioning 'shock' within the mind of avantgarde is though dianoetic in the apparent extensive reality yet not free from noetic revelation of 'sublime' at its occult core as intensive reality. This is the arcane rationality of 'liminal space' of the ontological self of avant-garde Exceptional Individuals hitting its counterpart threshold of consciousness of the audience where it is sublimated and 'actualized' through its dialogical self. An avant-garde 'newness' or 'shock' proposed by the 'liminal space' in the elan vital of Exceptional Individuals is the scrutinized result of selfcriticism and secession from its own mental institution, the dynamic disequilibrium of the 'Centripetal-Centrifugal Vitalism' finally resulting in criticism of and secession from the stagnated and oppressive dynamic disequilibrium of 'materialistic determinism' in its static core in the form of social institution.

'Sublime' has no stagnated connotation since it is always in the 'lived experience' and therefore it is transgenerated down the ages. The connotations of 'aerial perspective' by Monet, of 'modulation', 'realization' and 'structure' by Cezanne, of 'infrathin' by Duchamp, of 'action' by Pollock are visions of the para-reality of 'liminal space' of the ontological selves of avant-garde Exceptional Individuals. Now in the critical evaluation of these patent terms it is discovered that there was always a paradox of 'shock' hidden, viz. in Monet's 'aerial perspective' it doesn't reflect conventional perspective but create (in Deleuze's sense) an optical perspective through wave length gradation from saturation to desaturation of color to its hues by mixing complementary and a considerable amount of white, to show the optical illusion of recession of space. The 'sublime' was though dianoetic manifestation discovered extensively yet was a noetic revelation intensively envisioned in the 'liminal space' of Monet and then sublimated by Cezanne in his invention of 'sublime;' the pictorial language that changed the direction of plastic art permanently. This change was extensive manifestation of the intensive reality and opened the entire bountiful vista of 'shocks' of 'sublime' in modernism having sublimated through Picasso's episodes of Cubism. Then coming to Marcel Duchamp's *infrathin*, which according to him was impossible to be defined but can be given example of as "most minute of intervals or the slightest of differences" (Manning, 1016), was 'shock' of iconoclasm as 'sublime' sublimated through his descendant Conceptualism.

In the east 'sublime' is denoted as contemplative or meditative trait of 'vitalism' having autopoietic capacity generating concentric force for inner calmness. This intensive reality of dynamic equilibrium is transempirically proved in the east to beget revelation in the individual as self-realization with an arcane rise of consciousness to separate mind-body dualism by attaining stasis of mind. In the east it is called *nirvana*, its exemplar was, Siddharth Gautama, The Buddha (623-483 B.C.) Ironically the enlightening quality of of processual sympoiesis 'vitalism' venerating autopoiesis of 'Centripetal Vitalism' has gone invalid against the esoteric claims of the east, especially in Indian subcontinent, because it has fallen from its own promises for sublimated transformation into 'becoming' from 'being' through transcendental meditation expounded by the venerated cult of saints and Buddha. The so claimed medieval India's endogenous process of attaining trans-empirical calmness through processual 'vitalism' venerating 'Centripetal Vitalism' and accepting errors as part and parcel of creative evolution (*élan vital*) and yet remaining non-reactive to the natural 'determinism' of all kinds, went contextually invalid in our times. But on top of attenuating the Gnostic values of trans-empirical part of processual 'vitalism' India has continued to cling with its preservative-protected mummified posthumous tradition under a clandestine pact and misappropriated ulterior motives driven by deceptive and spurious 'determinism' of the outdated post-colonial feudalistic polity. Following the fall of Gnostic values of trans-empirical part of 'processual vitalism' in India esoteric cult has lost its validity, this is the reason we see residue of it in their monotonous spiritual-sect as vintage schools with their claims of anachronistic enlightenment. The anachronism of its own contextual Gnostic values of trans-empirical part of 'processual vitalism' in India became the major drawback in participation into both contextual 'spiritualdeterminism' international 'materialisticand determinism' which in turn invalidated its sublimation of 'sublime' in various fields including art and especially cultural industry, a contemptuously degenerated and dangerously anti-pre-individual swarm of selfopinionated pseudo-individuals, notoriously called Bollywood.

The role of the processual 'vitalism' could be seen liberating in two way; one, as being enlightened but then one is left with nothing to do with art, because to continue with art a reasonable 'dynamic disequilibrium' of 'parametric determinism' is essential. Therefore, the other, the reinvention of *avant-garde* through the interaction between dynamic disequilibrium of the 'vitalism' and dynamic disequilibrium of the 'determinism.'

7. 'VITALISM' ENCOUNTERING 'DETERMINISM' FOR SUBLIMATION OF 'SUBLIME' AND REINVENTING *AVANT-GARDE* AND 'NEWNESS' IN ART

The general notion that 'free will' is hindered by various types of determinism should be open to the possibility of other way round, in the case of reinventing avantgarde, that determinism redirects 'free will' to make humans act the way they do. Be it Buddha's universal wisdom which says "when you can't control what's happening, challenge yourself the way you respond to what's happening, that's where your power is." Heraclitus's famous notion "you can't step into the same river twice" or Leucippus's ascetic connotation, -"nothing occurs at random, but everything for a reason and by necessity" all points out to a complex system of perpetual dynamic impetus, the ever-changing parameters with static-dynamic dualism due to the complex interactive dynamic disequilibrium between 'vitalism' and 'determinism'. Therefore, this dynamic disequilibrium is the inevitable variant and the most legitimate activator of processual 'vitalism.'

Avant-garde Exceptional Individuals had been struggling for their own reinvention by responding to

sublimation of their 'sublime' via 'determinism' of changing times. Eventually the historical avant-garde was challenged by the deterministic situations ensued through modern technology opening up greater possibilities for mechanical reproduction of 'original' artwork. It helped art to sublimate its 'sublime' into the newer Consumer-Mass. This being the secret of the genuine 'change' and 'newness' is actually dynamic impetus reinventing avant-garde. It was here that the 'vitalism' of the pre-individual of avant-garde Exceptional Individual, 'determinism' of the boundlessly evolving industrial and then information societies, historical avant-garde and the traditional Modernism had real encounters. Now it is the very innate virtue of avant-garde that it sheds its own historical-traditional skin encountering whatsoever 'determinism' and thereby it reinvents itself and also redirects the ongoing traditional Modernism. Genuineness of any movement rests in the dynamic process of growing, ripening, decaying and dying; any genuine movement has been borne to life is bound to die, a movement which doesn't die actually never had lived. A genuine movement emerges out of 'lived experience.' Any movement initiated by the *avant-garde* can neither copy itself nor its viability be extended through external forces applied to it, even by the *avant-garde* itself. Also, a genuine avant-garde movement can't be accentuated by its own momentum by their agents, Mediocrity Mass. But its multiplicity of reproduction can maintain its momentum even in low consistency. In this process of 'actualization,' the 'aura' of the 'original' creation is diluted from its 'cult value' till 'exhibition value': (Benjamin, 1935). This was for the first time that traditional Modernism and historical avant-garde were sublimated to each other according to the changing society at the cost of loss of 'aura' and therefore in the present context loss of 'sublime' in the lack of newer way of sublimation.

Art coming out of *avant-garde*, by default ensures bad art or mediocre art to be easily confused with 'skillfully crafted' copies of the 'original,' which go even lesser in value than Essential Derivatives and thereby precludes the genuine act of transformation for the concerned Exceptional Individual's 'Centripetal Vitalism.' Therefore 'being', and its *élan vital* comes into danger. It demands investigation on how deliberate efforts for making frequent change disqualify the legitimacy of 'change' and 'newness.' This could be the precise reason for *avant-garde 'magnum-opuses'* essentially appealing till the farthest future. The classical and modern works don't need media publicity as their 'mediality' test is perpetually conducted by the Mediocrity-Mass. The case of postmodern artworks is different as they struggle with post-media condition and bear close affinity with the mass media; an independent reality vitally potent by now in sparking out from within the confused splitpersonality existence of vintage Exceptional Individuals of our times. Hence, it can be argued that the shifting perspective in creative cult accounting for 'change' and 'newness' in art, run by uni-dimensional 'determinism' of the technological and information society challenges 'vitalism' of the avant-garde Exceptional Individual. Dadaism as new avant-garde got its dynamic impetus in the disequilibrium of 'materialistic determinism' and 'cultural materialism' of the rapidly changing society of 20th century Europe and created array of all-time magnum opuses. By declaring its dissension with the traditional modernists, historical-traditional avant-garde and even its split-personality vintage Exceptional Individuals who were part of the bourgeoisie culture Dadaism envisaged 'Anti-Art Movement.' The 'newness' of the 'Anti-Art Movement' brewed the concept of genuine seminal philosophy while responding to changed situation of pluralistic society. By then, the society was no more interested in the 'retinal hit' lured by the lucid surface of Monet's "Water Lilies" or even Picasso's yet pictorial-spatial dynamism of "Les Demoiselles de Avignon" as well as entire Cubism and Futurism for that matter. Irrepressible need for freedom experienced in the 'liminal space' of the Dada revealing 'shocking' suggestions for action to respond to changed 'deterministic' situation 'imminent' in the society endowed them compatibility to reject 'rotten' and catch the 'sublime' as 'urgent' by seceding vintage avantgarde.

Duchamp's 'Readymades' were democratization of art and meant for common man by giving historical twist to the purpose of art as '*in service of mind*' in opposition to '*retinal art*' of bourgeois modernism preventing from making art just commodity. The interesting inherent ironies within the western creative and philosophical Plane of Immanence incessantly allowed paradox, backed up as dynamic impetus for the creative awareness of the *avant-garde* Exceptional Individuals to encounter and respond to intermittent change caused by the 'determinism. Dadaism, too ironically enticed for conversion into vintage *avant-garde*, however having ascetic-iconoclast orientation inseminated within its philosophical bearing, disowned 'Conceptualism' as its own shadow and seceded its own body that had expired into commodity and forever merged into *élan vital* enriching the 'Centripetal Vitalism' waited to be reborn choosing the appropriate womb in the creative generations to come. And eventually it had to be resurrected by the buoyant Abstract Expressionism in America with acclaimed 'newness' as a liberated post*avant-garde* Enigmatic Individuals but this time completely seceding from the of European philosophical hegemony declaring it as outdated traditional *avantgardism*.

Rosenberg was right in his vision defending democratic position of art in a society, which, by then was nearly transformed into Consumer-Mass of a capitalist society catering to which at the end of the day artist as Exceptional Individual as surviving species of avantgarde suffered 'alienation of the artist' syndrome (Rosenberg, 1960). This notion was guite opposite to the Walter Benjamin's theory of 'actualization' of 'original' artwork of the artist through 'mechanical Consumer-Mass. reproduction' catering to the Rosenberg supported and mentored Abstract Expressionism as a logical extension of the developments of avant-garde in America in critical resistance to the colloquial syllogism 'American extension of traditional modernist era of Europe,' while actually it was "American intellectuals' return to pragmatism in the 1940s being part of an effort to 'fight off' the 'Ideological Europeanization' of America" (Jachec, 2000).

8. EUROPEAN COGITO-COGNITIVE AESTHETICS OF 'FORMALISM' REPLACED BY AMERICAN TRANS-COGNITIVE AESTHETIC ALCHEMY OF 'SUBLIME.'

Under the philosophical parasol of 'American Transcendentalism' expounded by Emerson, Thoreau, Whitman and many others, Abstract Expressionism had special focus on 'individual creativity' and 'individual independence' of the artist. This added a new force to the ongoing movement of *avant-garde*.

For many artists who migrated to America faced the existential crisis created by W.W. II. it was the *élan vital* within the newly discovered 'vitalism' which was prompting them to search for real relationship of art and life. They experienced their 'being's' 'gaze' at blank walls for hours together to be congealed into 'becoming'

during their hideout in their native country and also in their refuge at America finally manifested in the sprinkles, splashes, drips associated with physical action on the vast virgin white field of canvas with a drastically renewed understanding of the mediality. Abstract Expressionism acknowledged the state of 'being as becoming' as attainment of 'sublime' having sprung from autopoiesis of 'vitalism' which remain unbeatable by the European determinism forever.

Jackson Pollock, Mark Rothko, Franz Kline, Robert Motherwell, Barnett Newman and many others were reported to have lost in autopoietic contemplation on the sheer whiteness of their large canvases and at times the blank white wall only to feel solacing 'nothingness' or 'void' as the aftermath of the W.W. II, and its cacophonous figurative verbose with images of catastrophic outcry. However, what they painted after this autopoiesis was the 'shock' received during the sympoiesis with their own nightmares. It was from an unprecedented source for the western artists that an unpredictable assuagement and inner calmness of dynamic equilibrium experienced within their innermost self, as 'Centripetal Vitalism,' thus was birth and sublimation of 'sublime' this time in America. A sense of 'sublime' as 'free will' sprang in the concept as well as in the works of these artists. This newer concept of abstraction addressed the existential issues and gave rise to phenomenological inspiration of 'vitalism' in the post-war capitalism of America. With reference to 'sublime' in Barnett Newman's art Jachec writes in 'Philosophy and Politics of Abstract Expressionism' as "new sublime was nothing less than his signature style with all of its existential and phenomenological motivations." Exceptional Individual's revelation through contemplative redemption from war-instigated fear was to attain instantaneous salvation through sublimation of 'sublime.' Discarding 'nostalgic glass of history' Jachec writes quoting Barnett Newman's 'Sublime is Now,' "residing not in the memory, legend, myth - the device of European paintingbut in subjectivity, in the absolute emotions of the individual....the image we produce is the self-evident one of revelation, real and concrete" (Jachec, 2000). This was the reinvention of avant-garde by the dynamic disequilibrium of Exceptional Individuals' processual 'vitalism' encountering dynamic disequilibrium of materialistic 'determinism' through sublimation of 'sublime'. It is here that for the first time in the western history of art and philosophy that

European cogito-cognitive aesthetics of 'formalism' was permanently replaced by American trans-cognitive aesthetic of 'sublime.'

9. TRANSCENDENTAL SUBLIME AS AESTHETIC OF 'UNKNOWN' AND DISCOVERY OF 'BASE MATERIALISM'

Therefore 'sublime' came as multiple purpose 'shock' in creative expression for American avant-garde of Abstract Expressionism and two of them were most important. Firstly, the reinvention of *avant-garde* as liberated or cutting itself off from European philosophical lineage. Secondly, the discovery of transcendental self through cathartic gestural abstraction. All that seceded from the hegemonic institution of 'formalism' and transcended by newly discovered 'base materialism' rejecting the formalistic modulation of the material manifested in Pollock's action and drip and Rothko's 'literally being in the painting' all headed towards 'unknown' as 'sublime' as a combination of aesthetic and supreme experience. This was guite new in western artistic tradition.

Longinus's comment 'Sublimity is the echo of a great soul' is followed by critical suggestion regarding attributes of the author in creating 'sublime,' while referring to Aristocrates he expounds 'the expression of sublime is more exposed to danger when it goes its own way without the guidance of knowledge – when it is suffered to be unstable and un-ballasted, - when it is left at the mercy of mere momentum and ignorant audacity.' In the lack of such guidance European artist feared to venture into transcendental realm but with motivation of dialectics conceptualized by the brigade of native philosophers of Transcendentalism, viz. Emerson, Thoreau, Whiteman motivated American Abstract Expressionists sublimated their 'sublime.'

To Rosenberg's contentment, Abstract Expressionism announced its permanent secession from the hegemony of 'Ideological Europeanization' of America. His hidden agenda was to give the final coup-de-grace to the outdated 'art for art's sake' 'aesthetic determinism' of 'formalism' through the 'Centripetal Vitalism' of 'unpredictable drip' of Pollock's transcendental 'sublime' in 'Action Painting.' This happened as 'materialistic determinism' encountered 'processual vitalism' and 'unconscious.' connected with the 'unknown.' 'nothingness' or 'void' via 'Centripetal Vitalism' and

discharged its individuation of experiencing 'vertical knowing,' the 'ontological self,' or the *élan vital* through new Gestural Abstraction. This was the sublimation of the 'sublime' of avant-garde Exceptional Individual individuating Abstract Expressionism. It can be seen that Abstract Expressionists had reinvented avant-garde in treating the 'mediality,' their artistic material, the oil paint or commercial enamel paint as 'base matter.' In Jackson Pollock's 'Drip' technique used in 'Action Painting,' the baseness of the material is treated in such a way that it (material) has already performed on its baser character that it can't further fall down from the level of base matter that was analogous to the level of 'The Big Toe.' Abstract Expressionism as post avant*aarde* seceded from both 'idealism' and 'materialism' (Bataille, 1985) rejecting its treatment of material in justifying 'Significant Form' in European modernist tradition and all arts that have 'the dependence on the 'ideal or 'elevated' (the high) on base matter (the low) and the contamination of this procedure is systematically denied by the ideal, which spits off base matter as whatever is disgusting veil and sub-human.' (Noys, 1998) But as usually happens, despite ample by post-war politics of American Left, abundantly funded by CIA, USIA, IC and encouraged by American Government, "Without any establishment institution to secede from, and having "survived on the impetus of the forward movement of Modernist art" finally Abstract Expressionism, as "avant-garde really entered its death throes."(Willette, 2012)

10. 'SUBLIME' OF ABSTRACT EXPRESSIONISM REFERRING TO ASIAN PHILOSOPHIES THROUGH 'VITALISM' ENCOUNTERING 'DETERMINISM'

The European philosophies doubtlessly has been quite hell-bent on rejecting the ontological contemplation addressing numenon through phenomenon which is why their abstractionists like Kazimir Malevich, Kandinsky, Klee, Mondrian were though intuitive and subtle yet apprehensive to transcendentalism. In spite of from materialistic them being liberating the determinism European abstraction couldn't propound a consolidated 'Non-Philosophical' transcendence as movement of *avant-garde* as in one way or other they remained dominated by Greenberg's 'Formalism'. Kandinsky can be excuse for his musical roots, as 'chance' was taken in into process yet not without risking to transcend empirical boundaries whereas shattering Greenberg's concept of 'Significant Form' Abstract Expressionism through 'drip of paint' radically trespassed limits of the canvas and surrendered to the infinite unconscious, the 'formless.' Bataille refers to 'sublime' of 'formless' through criticism of Marx's Dialectical Materialism with non-religious spiritualism, his own philosophy of 'Base Materialism.' European philosophers generally refrained to ponder upon the metaphysical side of reality except Deleuze, Spinoza, Bergson, Nietzsche and Heidegger who never abandoning it reconcile European avant-garde with classical and traditional elements of philosophy. They always had the concern for the 'ultimate nature of philosophy' guided from Plato through Descartes and Hegel with a stress on 'how does the thought think' and 'what is being.' (Pearson, 2007). Actually, unlike European avant-garde the American avant-garde through Abstract Expressionism neither denying 'determinism' nor rejecting 'vitalism' rather took the 'Middle Path,' the crux-action taken on the moot point we find in Buddha's teaching. Like Bergson's élan vital, Deleuze's 'vitalism' and Jung's animus-anima addressed the holistic system of metaphysics accounting shared consciousness. This again redirects to both Aristotle's and Stoics' ethical view on intellectual contemplation as highest happiness, the Eudaimonia which for Epicureans was Ataraxia still falls short to Brahmananda (absolute bliss) (Vatsyayana, 2015) of Indian Perennial Philosophy. Quite unlike wester dialectical materialism, the spiritual materialism of *Brahmananda* uniquely requires the total withdrawal from 'determinism' and complete contemplation on the ontological self. The eastern 'vertical knowing' as *Dhyana* and *Zen* of the ontological self as 'vitalism' in modern philosophy though doesn't discredit western philosophy however sports heuristic reasoning that reality-checked entelechy and teleology. Though, 'vitalism' acknowledges the beauty of western philosophy yet not without taking democratic stand on dynamic equilibrium through arguments on the credibility of ontological self as 'ontic referent', of 'being as becoming' and 'self-overcoming.' This was built in such a way that there was no possibility to misuse monism that might result in solipsism syndrome caused due to the lack of self-criticism. Hence the quality of 'sublime' and its sublimation depends on validity of equilibrium of 'Centripetal Vitalism' dynamic undergoing dynamic test-encounters with

disequilibrium between the discrete ideas and realities reinventing *avant-garde* through self-criticism.

Robert Motherwell in his writing confirms the presence of 'new sublime' in the Abstract Expressionism which acknowledged Emerson's 'Transcendentalism' that in turn developed with the close observation of Indian Perennial Philosophy, viz. The Vedas, and The Upanishads (The Vedanta).

Since the genetic nature of *avant-garde* is to reinvent itself by constantly breaking away from convention through secession and succession from its most oppressive institution and work on the newer creative ideas with unique experiments through the mediality, Abstract Expressionism took to autopoiesis for contemplative awakening required for reinventing *avant-garde*.

European ego-consciousness tries to swallow the unconscious either due to unawareness or ignorance to the fact that true spark of 'newness' is effortless and a result of contemplative awakening. Actually, thinking of 'newness' is considered to be yet 'unknown,' because the 'new' which is yet to happen should necessarily be vet 'unknown' hidden in the realm of 'unconscious.' However, "universal consciousness is logically identical with unconsciousness" attained by eastern "past masters in the art of self-controlled, yogis attained in Samadhi, a state of ecstasy, which so far as we know is equivalent to state of unconsciousness" yet "the correct application of the methods described in the Pali Canon or in the Yoga Sutra includes remarkable extension of consciousness." (Jung, 1968) Jung while connoting such an austere eastern state of mind in contrast with that of the European that is hammered by "I Think Therefore I Am"ego-consciousness, writes, "in their case (eastern) unconscious has swallowed up eqo-consciousness" but "our European ego-consciousness is therefore inclined to swallow up the unconscious, and if this should not prove feasible we try to suppress it." (Ibid.)

While elaborating what constitutes 'sublimity' in literature, Hameed quotes from the literary theorist of 1st century AD Longinus's 'On the Sublime' and explains it purpose "is not to convince the reason of the reader or the audience but to transport him out of the material condition. This elevation or transport is done through the power of speech or words" (P.A., A.H., 2020). Analogically, in Abstract Expressionism it was the power of application of the paint. The concept of 'sublime' referring to Indian Rasa Siddhanta (Theory) connotes that the artistic creation could be a success only if it achieves the supreme artistic purpose of creating a state of pure bliss experiencing ananda or aesthetic pleasure initially which boundlessly extends to Brahmananda or the absolute bliss. (Vatsyayana, 2015) In 'Concept of Space: Ancient -Modern,' Jitatmananda differentiates Indian notion of 'sublime' with that of the Greeks by saying that while the latter searched for the Ultimate Reality in the World Outside, the 'Bhutakasha,' the outside space in which the former as already having failed in finding infinite reality turned this search to *inside space*, the 'Cidakasha.' The difference in approach between outside and inside he annotates with the examples of Christ praying with his open eyes 'deep gaze in the space above,' whereas the Buddha's and Vivekananda's closed eyes 'gazed deep, deep within the cidkasha.' He connotes the supreme enjoyment as 'bliss of Chidanandarupah- Shivoham, Shivoham,' meaning 'I am pure consciousness, without beginning, without end, I am Shivam, I am Shivam' (Jitatmananda, 2002). Shivam again means higher consciousness in Indian Perennial Philosophy.

The aesthetic beauty generated out of intellectual rumination differed from the beauty manifested from inside out with contemplative awakening followed by perennial awareness with the gift of 'Sublime.' Since 'sublime' could be a creative expression of both intellectual rumination and contemplative autopoiesis there must be a universal point where respectively west and eastern thoughts meet to accord with the actual 'sublime' which wouldn't be satiated without its Sanskrit translation as 'atyucca' (high or lofty) with intense use of prefix of 'ati' to mean 'exceeding' or 'transcending' may be used for sublime experience. (Mishra, 1998) Explaining 'sublime' Otto connotes from 'Veda' as adbhuta, explaining as "super transcendent marvel and its attractive spell." (Otto, 1923). Irrespective of the fact that the European meaning of 'sublime' has been appropriated to many subdued connotations satiating purposes of its respective philosophers, as just unlike that of the eastern which have only one meaning of 'sublime' and that is 'awe' both superlative negative and superlative positive. Sublime in European context is never alien but the consecutive brigades of rationalism, empiricism and dialectical materialism had critically hammered it to obsolescence despite German philosopher Otto Rudolph's clear interpretation about

'numinous' eventually adopted by American avant-garde after three decades only because he having the tag of religious author. According to him "the idea of sublime is closely similar to that if numinous, sublime exhibits the same peculiar dual character as the numinous; it is at once daunting, and yet again singularly attracting, in its impress upon the mind." (Ibid.) According to Otto 'sublime' having its components as 'Mysterium' Tremendum' connoting as 'absolute un-approachability' and 'absolute overpowering.' (Ibid.) Therefore, 'sublime' being the eastern world view, notably borrowed by the erstwhile Euro-American philosophers percolated in the collective unconscious of west eventually providing American Abstract Expressionism the audacity to revolt against the European philosophy's logical limit of knowledge. The experience of the cosmic infinitude of 'sublime' through what Bataille called 'base materialism' is an experience that is near to eastern non-material transcendental sublime, based on which American avant-garde's slogan of liberation 'American Sublime' eventually developed. This is a departure from the hegemony of "I Think Therefore I Am" slogan and a complete surrender to the instinctive adaptation of what in the east is colloquially understood as "I Contemplate Therefore I Am."

It is a common parlance in the east, to become inward by closing the physical eye from bhutakasha and opening-up the inner eye to the cidakasha in order to contemplate on any 'form' of deity or even the 'formless.' To tackle the 'imminent terrible' of negative superlative of the bhutakasha by the inner, hidden yet powerful controller 'immanent terrible' of positive superlative of *cidakasha* is a colloquial technique in the east. This is quite analogous with the severity of existential trouble through 'materialistic 'determinism' of the W.W. II caused in the western bhutakasha for mustering contemplative autopoiesis into cidakasha of the new creative consciousness within the processual 'vitalism' among the avant-garde Exceptional Individuals of Abstract Expressionism. The immanent élan vital of the cidakasha of American Abstract Expressionists opened their inner vision to the 'sublime.' This was a sort of self-organization of the *élan-vital* to reboot 'free-will' with cathartic self-absorption into cidakasha, the 'inside space' with a complete surrender to the higher consciousness, the Shiva.

Here, the dynamic-equilibrium of the 'vitalism' of the Exceptional Individuals associated with Abstract

Expressionism as *cidakasha, or* 'inner space' is interacting with the dynamic-disequilibrium of the 'determinism' of *bhutakasha,* 'outer space.' This interaction sparks their 'liminal space' or in Duchamp's sense '*infrathin,*' that actually matters for the 'newness' in art and the secret of what provides the idea of 'shock' in the *avant-garde*. Therefore the 'shock' inseminated in the 'liminal space' of the *avant-garde* in its most alienated state was 'Sublime'. This 'sublime' part of '*alienation*' itself was alien to Karl Marx who was vehemently criticizing '*artist alienation*' through materialistic standard of comparison by dint of his famous comment '*alienation as a process whereby the worker is made to feel foreign to the product.*'

The 'Sublime' that can give most unexpected solace as surplus value of human experience hidden in the collective unconscious is reported to rise during the hopelessly adverse situations in everyday life. Therefore 'sublime' is the unpossessable experience ranging from base complacency to transcendental Absolute Bliss, free from any satisfaction of substantial materialism. A supreme experience which is mystically and transcendentally elating and ecstatic attained through 'nothing' and 'unknown', "obscure apprehension of the unknown; of a presence which is no longer in any way distinct from the absence" (Bataille, 1988) 'Sublime' is an trans-empirical wisdom through mysterious 'wormholes' of 'lived experience' as its attributes. 'Vitalism' is part and parcel until Deleuze proposes of metaphysical dimension to Kantian philosophy through Transcendental Empiricism.

Thus, we see that contemplative process of intensive autopoiesis in the 'vitalism' of pre-individual of Exceptional Individual sublimating 'sublime' has been actualized to the Consumer Mass through the interactive dynamic disequilibrium between 'processual vitalism' and 'materialistic determinism' as great extensive sympoietic processors. But in this process the 'aura' of the original artwork is lost causing *alienation* in the creative individuals. 'Alienation' is driving force of élan vital hidden in the both immanent as shared consciousness and transcendent as collective unconscious.

Therefore 'alienation' is an Absolute Bliss for avantgarde creative individuals than a curse for it refurbishes their contemplative autopoiesis and ameliorating their 'sublime' to welcome democratic sympoiesis. 'Sublime' and 'sublimation' being autopoietic-sympoietic doublet perennially grants boon of 'alienation' to avant-garde Exceptional Individuals with as purest required impetus transforming their souls to be reincarnated as Enigmatic Individuals in themselves who tirelessly envisage for post avant-garde. This transformation venerates the élan vital of post avant-garde Enigmatic Individuals to constantly bear oddest periodic 'shock' of 'alienation' for losing the 'aura' of their oeuvre for they are committed to perpetually 'shocking' the world with newer aesthetic alchemy.

REFERENCES

- [1] Nicolini, A. (2020, 7 22). www.scienzaefilosofia.com/2019/12/19/abitarela-soglia-simondon-e-lindividuazione-delvivente. Retrieved from www.scienzaefilosofia.com: http://www.scienzaefilosofia.com
- [2] Otto, R. (1917). *The Idea of the Holy: An Inquiry into the Non-rational Factor in the Idea of the Devine and its Relation to the Rational*, London: Oxford University Press.
- [3] Kant, I. (1881). *Critique of Pure Reason*. London: Macmillan and co.
- [4] Barett, M. (2020, July 15). www.ocw.mit.edu/courses/global-languages. Retrieved from www.ocw.mit.edu: https://www.ocw.mit.edu/courses/globallanguages
- [5] Read H. (1968). A Concise History of Modern Painting. USA: Praeger Publisher Inc.
- [6] Willette J. (2020, 7 15). www arthistoryunstuffed.com/death-of-the-avantgarde. Retrieved from www. arthistoryunstuffed.com: https//www. arthistoryunstuffed.com/death-of-the-avantgarde
- [7] Bergson, H., (1907), *Creative Evolution*, Dover Publication Inc., N.Y., USA
- [8] Loland, O. J. (2020, July 18). www.itself.blog/2007/05/04/life-is-productionon-deleuzes-vitalism-i. Retrieved from www.itself.blog: https://www.itself.blog
- [9] Remme, D. (2020, July 15). www.newmaterialism.eu/almanac/v/vitalism.ht

ml. Retrieved from www.newmaterialism.eu: https://www.newmaterialism.eu

- [10] Colebrook, C. (2002) *Understanding Deleuze*, Allen & Unvin, Australia
- [11] Grosz, E. (2020, July 1). https://www.cairn.info/revue-internationale-dephilosophie-2007-3-page-287.htm#. Retrieved from www.cairn.info: https://www.cairn.info
- [12] Adkins, B. (2020, Feb 9). https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.5325/jspecphil.3 0.3.0352. Retrieved from www.jstor.org: https://www.jstor.org
- [13] osborne, t. (2020, july 17). https://www.researchgate.net/publication/2958 66737_Vitalism_as_Pathos. Retrieved from www.researchgate.net: https://www.researchgate.net
- [14] P.A., A. H. (2020, July 13). academia.edu/8355818/Aesthetic_interplay_bet ween_Bharatas_Theory_of_Rasa_and_Longinus_T heory_of_Sublimity. Retrieved from www.academia.edu: https://www.academia.edu
- [15] Vatsyayan, K. (2015). *Metaphors of the Indian Art and Other Essays*, New Delhi: DK Printworld (P) Ltd.
- [16] Jitatmananda, S. (1991). *Concept of Space Ancient and Modern*. India: Abhinav Publication.
- [17] Mishra, V. (1998). *Devotional Poetics and the Indian Sublime*. USA. State University of New York Press.
- [18] Wilson, E. (2020, 5 20). *jstor.org/stable/4403570*. Retrieved from www.jstor.org: https://www.jstor.org
- [19] Newman, B. (2020, 3 14). www.theoria.artzoo.com/the-sublime-is-now-barnett-newman. Retrieved from www.theoria.art-zoo.com: http://www.theoria.art-zoo.com
- [20] Deleuze G. (1994). *Difference and Repetition*. *France:* Columbia University Press.
- [21] Deleuze, G. & Guattari, F. (1987). A Thousand Plateaus; Capitalism and Schizophrenia. London: Continuum.
- [22] Manning, E. (. (2020, 7 2). doi.org/10.1177/0090591715625877. Retrieved from www.doi.org: https://www.doi.org

- [23] Benjamin, W. (1935). *The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproducibility*. London: Harvard University Press.
- [24] Rosenberg, H. (1960). *The Tradition of the New*. USA: D Capo Press
- [25] Jachec, N. (2000). *The Philosophy and Politics of Abstract Expressionism* 1940-1960. USA: Cambridge University Press.
- [26] Bataille, G. (1988) Visions of Excess: Selected Writings 1927-1939. UK: Manchester University Press.
- [27] Noys, B. (2020, 6 29). danieljewesbury.org/NoysGeorgesBataillesbase materialism.pdf. Retrieved from www.danieljewesbury.org: https://danieljewesbury.org
- [28] (2020, J, W. 15). 7 WWW. arthistoryunstuffed.com/death-of-the-avantgarde. Retrieved from www. arthistoryunstuffed.com: https//www. arthistoryunstuffed.com/death-of-the-avantgarde
- [29] Pearson, K. A. (2020, 67). *doi.org*. Retrieved from www.doi.org: https://www.doi.org
- [30] Jung, C.G. (1968). Archetypes and the Collective Unconscious-Part 1-Vol 9, New York: Princeton University Press.